

# Where Can Indexes and Factors Fall Short?

February 27, 2025

**Eduardo Repetto** 

**Chief Investment Officer** 

FOR FINANCIAL PROFESSIONAL USE ONLY/NOT FOR DISTRIBUTION TO THE PUBLIC

#### **Avantis Investors From Launch to Today**



#### December 31, 2024 Avantis Investors

- \$57.5B total AUM
- \$17.6B net flows in 2024
- 30 strategies
  - 24 equity
  - 3 fixed income
  - 2 real assets
  - 1 global balanced
- 20 strategies over \$100M
- 3,500+ institutional and advisory clients

#### Data as of 12/31/2024.

#### Avantis Investors® By American Century Investments®

#### At Five Years: Avantis by the Numbers



Data as of 12/31/2024 unless otherwise noted. 1. Based on AUM out of 328 ETF issuers overall and 279 active ETF issuers as of December 31, 2024. Avantis Investors



#### Agenda





## **Some Factor Trivia**

FOR FINANCIAL PROFESSIONAL USE ONLY/NOT FOR DISTRIBUTION TO THE PUBLIC

Avantis Investors® By American Century Investments®



Momentum Low Volatility Value Quality Equal Weight Multi-factor

Russell 3000 Index

Source: Morningstar. Sample data shown for illustrative purposes only.



Momentum Low Volatility Value Quality Equal Weight Multi-factor

Source: Morningstar. Sample data shown for illustrative purposes only.

FOR FINANCIAL PROFESSIONAL USE ONLY/NOT FOR DISTRIBUTION TO THE PUBLIC

Russell 3000 Index



Momentum Low Volatility Value Quality Equal Weight Multi-factor

Source: Morningstar. Sample data shown for illustrative purposes only.

Russell 3000 Index



Momentum Low Volatility Value Quality Equal Weight Multi-factor

Russell 3000 Index

Source: Morningstar. Sample data shown for illustrative purposes only.



Momentum Low Volatility Value Quality Equal Weight Multi-factor

Source: Morningstar. Sample data shown for illustrative purposes only.

FOR FINANCIAL PROFESSIONAL USE ONLY/NOT FOR DISTRIBUTION TO THE PUBLIC

Russell 3000 Index

Which of these indexes has the highest active share with the S&P 500 Index?

- a. S&P 500 Value Index
- b. S&P 500 Momentum Index
- c. S&P 500 Quality Index
- d. S&P 500 Equal Weighted Index
- e. S&P 500 Low Volatility Index
- f. S&P 500 Quality Value Momentum Index

Which of these indexes has the highest active share with the S&P 500 Index?

- a. S&P 500 Value Index
- b. S&P 500 Momentum Index
- c. S&P 500 Quality Index
- d. S&P 500 Equal Weighted Index
- e. S&P 500 Low Volatility Index (81%)
- f. S&P 500 Quality Value Momentum Index

Which of these indexes has the lowest active share with the S&P 500 Index?

- a. S&P 500 Value Index
- b. S&P 500 Momentum Index
- c. S&P 500 Quality Index
- d. S&P 500 Equal Weighted Index
- e. S&P 500 Low Volatility Index
- f. S&P 500 Quality Value Momentum Index

Which of these indexes has the lowest active share with the S&P 500 Index?

- a. S&P 500 Value Index (37%)
- b. S&P 500 Momentum Index (66%)
- c. S&P 500 Quality Index (72%)
- d. S&P 500 Equal Weighted Index (53%)
- e. S&P 500 Low Volatility Index (81%)
- f. S&P 500 Quality Value Momentum Index (14%)

### **Multi-Factor Faces Similar Labeling Issues**







STOXX U.S. Equity Factor Index



S&P 500 QVM Top 90% MF Index



These are all holdings-based style trails of multi-factor index-based strategies with large cap core benchmarks.

- Active share versus the Russell 1000 Index ranges from ~20% to ~70%
- Number of holdings ranged from <300 to >700
- 2024 turnover ranged from 15% to 267%
- Realized annualized tracking error versus the Russell 1000 Index over the last 3 years ranged from <1.75% to >7.5%

Source: Morningstar. Sample data shown for illustrative purposes only.

### **Multi-Factor Strategy**

#### Imagine A Two Theme (Value and Quality) Equally Weighted Multifactor Strategy

#### Value defined by 4 variables equally weighted:

- Earnings yield (Net Income/MCap),
- Book/Price,
- Free Cash Flow/Price,
- Dividend Yield

### Quality defined by 10 variables equally weighted:

- ROE (Net Income/Book Value)
- Cash Flow ROI
- Free Cash Flows/Sales
- Cash Flows/Interests Paid
- Free Cash Flows/Current Liabilities
- Cash Flow/Total Debt
- Low Volatility
- Change in Accruals
- Balance Sheet Operating Accruals/Total Assets
- Accruals/Net Operating Assets

#### What is the outcome of this security selection process?

# **Issues in Design and Implementation**

FOR FINANCIAL PROFESSIONAL USE ONLY/NOT FOR DISTRIBUTION TO THE PUBLIC

Avantis Investors® By American Century Investments®

### What's Driven the Growth in Indexing?

#### Non-total market index funds capture the majority of index fund assets



**Notes:** The chart shows the development of assets under management in the categories of non-total market index funds, total market index funds, and active funds. Time period observed: January 1995 to December 2020.

Sources: Vanguard calculations, based on data from Morningstar, Inc.

Source: https://corporate.vanguard.com/content/corporatesite/us/en/corp/articles/new-form-of-active-investing.html

### What is Truly "Passive"?

In "Truly Passive" there is no security selection

Market Portfolio = Only Truly Passive

Once we deviate from the market, "someone" is selecting securities



FOR FINANCIAL PROFESSIONAL USE ONLY/NOT FOR DISTRIBUTION TO THE PUBLIC Active/Strategic Beta/Passive Framework is credited to Ben Johnson at Morningstar.

#### What's in a Name?

	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024
	S&P	Wilshire	Wilshire	S&P	CRSP	Russell	Wilshire	Morningstar	CRSP	CRSP	S&P	Wilshire	CRSP	Morningstar	S&P	CRSP
	Russell	CRSP	CRSP	Russell	Russell	CRSP	CRSP	S&P	Wilshire	Wilshire	Wilshire	Russell	MSCI	CRSP	Morningstar	Wilshire
	CRSP	Russell	Morningstar	CRSP	S&P	Wilshire	Morningstar	Russell	S&P	Morningstar	Russell	CRSP	Russell	S&P	Russell	Russell
	Wilshire	Morningstar	MSCI	Wilshire	Morningstar	S&P	MSCI	CRSP	MSCI	MSCI	CRSP	S&P	S&P	Wilshire	CRSP	Morningstar
	MSCI	S&P	Russell	Morningstar	MSCI	MSCI	S&P	MSCI	Morningstar	Russell	Morningstar	MSCI	Wilshire	MSCI	Wilshire	MSCI
	Morningstar	MSCI	S&P	MSCI	Wilshire	Morningstar	Russell	Wilshire	Russell	S&P	MSCI	Morningstar	Morningstar	Russell	MSCI	S&P
MAX - MIN RETURN																

#### U.S. Large Cap Value Index Returns (%) Ranked from Highest to Lowest (2009-2024)

#### U.S. Small Cap Value Index Returns (%) Ranked from Highest to Lowest (2009-2024)

	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024
	Morningstar	CRSP	CRSP	Wilshire	S&P	CRSP	Wilshire	Russell	CRSP	Wilshire	S&P	Wilshire	Morningstar	Morningstar	CRSP	CRSP
	CRSP	Wilshire	S&P	CRSP	CRSP	Morningstar	CRSP	S&P	S&P	CRSP	Wilshire	CRSP	S&P	CRSP	Wilshire	Wilshire
	Wilshire	Morningstar	Morningstar	Morningstar	Morningstar	Wilshire	MSCI	Morningstar	MSCI	S&P	CRSP	Russell	MSCI	MSCI	S&P	Morningstar
	MSCI	S&P	MSCI	S&P	Russell	S&P	S&P	Wilshire	Morningstar	Russell	Russell	S&P	Wilshire	S&P	MSCI	MSCI
	S&P	Russell	Wilshire	Russell	Wilshire	MSCI	Russell	MSCI	Russell	MSCI	MSCI	MSCI	Russell	Wilshire	Russell	Russell
	Russell	MSCI	Russell	MSCI	MSCI	Russell	Morningstar	CRSP	Wilshire	Morningstar	Morningstar	Morningstar	CRSP	Russell	Morningstar	S&P
MAX - MIN RETURN																

FOR FINANCIAL PROFESSIONAL USE ONLY/NOT FOR DISTRIBUTION TO THE PUBLIC Data over the 15-year period from 1/1/2009-12/31/2024. Source: Morningstar. Return periods greater than one year are annualized. It is not possible to invest directly in an index. Past performance is no guarantee of future results.

#### Avantis Investors® By American Century Investments®

#### What's in a Name? Answer: Not Enough

	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024
	S&P	Wilshire	Wilshire	S&P	CRSP	Russell	Wilshire	Morningstar	CRSP	CRSP	S&P	Wilshire	CRSP	Morningstar	S&P	CRSP
	21.18	16.56	3.74	17.68	33.34	13.45	-0.79	20.01	17.16	-5.40	31.93	7.37	26.51	-0.35	22.23	16.00
	Russell	CRSP	CRSP	Russell	Russell	CRSP	CRSP	S&P	Wilshire	Wilshire	Wilshire	Russell	MSCI	CRSP	Morningstar	Wilshire
	19.69	16.06	1.43	17.51	32.53	13.29	-0.86	17.40	16.31	-5.94	27.72	2.80	26.29	-2.01	11.76	15.01
	CRSP	Russell	Morningstar	CRSP	S&P	Wilshire	Morningstar	Russell	S&P	Morningstar	Russell	CRSP	Russell	S&P	Russell	Russell
	18.42	15.51	1.35	16.71	31.99	13.00	-2.13	17.34	15.36	-6.90	26.54	2.26	25.16	-5.22	11.46	14.37
	Wilshire	Morningstar	MSCI	Wilshire	Morningstar	S&P	MSCI	CRSP	MSCI	MSCI	CRSP	S&P	S&P	Wilshire	CRSP	Morningstar
	16.98	15.17	0.64	14.56	31.78	12.36	-2.82	16.93	14.42	-7.96	25.85	1.36	24.90	-5.51	9.17	14.10
	MSCI	S&P	Russell	Morningstar	MSCI	MSCI	S&P	MSCI	Morningstar	Russell	Morningstar	MSCI	Wilshire	MSCI	Wilshire	MSCI
	16.91	15.10	0.39	14.06	31.22	11.36	-3.13	15.83	14.25	-8.27	25.53	0.05	24.53	-6.96	9.17	13.55
	Morningstar	MSCI	S&P	MSCI	Wilshire	Morningstar	Russell	Wilshire	Russell	S&P	MSCI	Morningstar	Morningstar	Russell	MSCI	
	16.39	13.46	-0.48	13.96	30.24	9.37	-3.83	15.44	13.66	-8.95	24.61	-1.65	23.28	-7.54	8.35	12.29
RETURN	4.78	3.10	4.22	3.72	3.10	4.08	3.04	4.57	3.49	3.55	7.31	9.01	3.24	7.18	13.88	3.72
ILL FORM																

#### U.S. Large Cap Value Index Returns (%) Ranked from Highest to Lowest (2009-2024)

#### U.S. Small Cap Value Index Returns (%) Ranked from Highest to Lowest (2009-2024)

	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024
	Morningstar	CRSP	CRSP	Wilshire	S&P	CRSP	Wilshire	Russell	CRSP	Wilshire	S&P	Wilshire	Morningstar	Morningstar	CRSP	CRSP
	40.28	27.18	0.01	21.52	39.98	10.63	-4.36	31.74	11.83	-12.04	24.54	6.16	31.79	-6.60	15.91	12.42
	CRSP	Wilshire	S&P	CRSP	CRSP	Morningstar	CRSP	S&P	S&P	CRSP	Wilshire	CRSP	S&P	CRSP	Wilshire	Wilshire
	37.81	26.76	-1.38	20.50	38.47	10.03	-4.64	31.32	11.51	-12.27	23.08	5.75	30.95	-9.27	15.35	11.51
	Wilshire	Morningstar	Morningstar	Morningstar	Morningstar	Wilshire	MSCI	Morningstar	MSCI	S&P	CRSP	Russell	MSCI	MSCI	S&P	Morningstar
	37.45	25.96	-1.84	18.30	35.71	9.09	-5.89	27.96	8.44	-12.64	22.76	4.63	29.77	-10.33	14.89	9.67
	MSCI	S&P	MSCI	S&P	Russell	S&P	S&P	Wilshire	Morningstar	Russell	Russell	S&P	Wilshire	S&P	MSCI	MSCI
	29.21	24.72	-4.72	18.21	34.52	7.54	-6.67	27.68	8.40	-12.86	22.39	2.53	29.24	-11.04	14.77	8.82
	S&P	Russell	Wilshire	Russell	Wilshire	MSCI	Russell	MSCI	Russell	MSCI	MSCI	MSCI	Russell	Wilshire	Russell	Russell
	22.85	24.50	-5.34	18.05	33.80	6.64	-7.47	26.62	7.84	-13.60	21.27	1.20	28.27	-14.22	14.65	8.05
	Russell	MSCI	Russell	MSCI	MSCI	Russell	Morningstar	CRSP	Wilshire	Morningstar	Morningstar	Morningstar	CRSP	Russell	Morningstar	S&P
	20.58	24.21	-5.50	17.69	32.73	4.22	-8.65	24.82	7.42	-16.61	19.96	1.01	28.15	-14.48	14.58	7.56
RETURN	19.70	2.97	5.51	3.82	7.25	6.41	4.28	6.92	4.41	4.57	4.57	5.16	3.64	7.88	1.33	4.86

FOR FINANCIAL PROFESSIONAL USE ONLY/NOT FOR DISTRIBUTION TO THE PUBLIC Data over the 15-year period from 1/1/2009-12/31/2024. Source: Morningstar. Return periods greater than one year are annualized. It is not possible to invest directly in an index. Past performance is no guarantee of future results.

#### Avantis Investors® By American Century Investments®

#### **Pre-Launch vs. Post-Launch**



Research from Morningstar shows how indexes that index funds are tracking have performed pre- fund launch and post- fund launch.

- 75% of indexes beat their Morningstar Category Index over the five years prior to the fund launch, with a median outperformance of 140 bps per year.
- In the five years following launch, those numbers shrank to **57% and 39 bps per year**.

#### FOR FINANCIAL PROFESSIONAL USE ONLY/NOT FOR DISTRIBUTION TO THE PUBLIC Source: Mining for Alpha With Index Funds, Dan Sotiroff (Morningstar), July 2023

## **Factors vs. Fundamentals**

FOR FINANCIAL PROFESSIONAL USE ONLY/NOT FOR DISTRIBUTION TO THE PUBLIC

In what year was the first single-factor model developed?

- a. 1949
- b. 1964
- c. 1981
- d. 1993

In what year was the first single-factor model developed?

- a. 1949
- b. 1964 CAPM (Sharpe)
- c. 1981
- d. 1993

How many factors have been documented today?

- a. 100
- b. 200
- c. 400
- d. 1,000

How many factors have been documented today?

- a. 100
- b. 200
- c. 400 A Census of the Factor Zoo (Harvey/Liu, 2019)
  d. 1,000

### **400 Factors...and Counting**

Data availability has allowed researchers and practitioners to "search" for patterns using historical data

- most of these patterns have no reason to exist they happened randomly in the past
- Some factors provide benefits (but not increased expected returns), e.g. Low volatility
- Some factors may not be directly implementable but can enhance expected returns, e.g. momentum

#### What should investors do to cut through the factor noise?

See A Census of the Factor Zoo, Harvey/Liu (2019)

### **We Should Consider Valuation**

Use the learnings from asset pricing and factor research but within a valuation framework.

Price = Equity + <u>Profits</u> Discount Rate	Equity Price AND Equity
Expected returns (discount rates) are a function of:	Differences in expected returns across securities are captured in valuation ratios
Prices	Need to define
Current equity	Equity (modified B/M)
Expected profits	Profits (cash-based operating profitability)

Goal is to find reliable proxies for equity and profits that incorporate enhancements to have a more robust approach.

### **Implications for Expected Returns**



Source: Avantis Investors and Sunil Wahal, CRSP/Compustat, U.S. Securities, 1973-2023

# What Exposure do Indexes and Factors Offer Through The Lens of Fundamentals?

FOR FINANCIAL PROFESSIONAL USE ONLY/NOT FOR DISTRIBUTION TO THE PUBLIC

#### Russell 1000 Index



#### Russell 1000 Value Index



#### S&P 500 Value Index



#### Value Factor Index



#### **Quality Factor Index**



#### **MSCI World ex USA**



Higher ER	34.3%
Neutral	33.7%
Lower ER	32.0%

#### **MSCI World ex USA Value**

		Low				High			
			A	djusted Bt	N				
	High	3.5%	1.3%	6.8%	2.1%	1.1%	14.9%		
sed ing ility		2.4%	5.2%	2.4%	4.8%	3.4%	18.2%	Higher ER	41.6%
Cash Ba Operati rofitabi		1.0%	0.8%	5.6%	7.3%	5.0%	19.7%	Neutral	29.7%
	(	0.8%	2.8%	3.2%	8.2%	10.1%	25.0%	Lower ER	28.8%
	Low	1.2%	1.1%	1.1%	5.4%	13.5%	22.2%		
		9.0%	11.1%	19.0%	27.8%	33.1%	100.0%		

#### **What Issues Do Factor Indexes Face?**

Let's see the effects of deviating from the market

#### U.S. Companies Sorted by Profitability and Book-to-Price

			Adjuste	ed Book-	to-Price		
		Low				High	
ב _ ק	High	6.4%	11.7%	1.1%	0.4%	0.1%	19.7%
ase ting bilit		4.4%	3.4%	8.8%	2.2%	1.0%	19.8%
B-ר erat ital		4.0%	0.9%	6.4%	10.6%	2.1%	23.9%
ast Ope		2.5%	3.2%	3.5%	2.4%	7.2%	18.8%
Ощ	Low	2.2%	0.6%	3.3%	4.0%	7.6%	17.8%
		19.6%	19.8%	23.1%	19.5%	18.0%	100.0%

Source: Avantis, Bloomberg, U.S. companies represented by the Russell 3000 Index, September 30, 2024

### What Issues Do Factor Indexes Face?

Shifting an allocation towards high B/P produces a shift to companies with low profitability.



Searching for a B/P premium, as suggested by the factor, produces a negative profitability premium.

Source: Avantis, Bloomberg, U.S. companies represented by the Russell 3000 Index, September 30, 2024

### What Issues Do Factor Indexes Face?

Shifting an allocation towards high profitability produces a shift to companies with low B/P.



Searching for a profitability premium, as suggested by the factor, produces a negative B/P premium.

Source: Avantis, Bloomberg, U.S. companies represented by the Russell 3000 Index, September 30, 2024

- The creation of factor indexes and smart/strategic beta strategies tracking factor indexes increased the number of tools available to implement systematic factor tilts into asset allocations
- Many single factor indexes can run into similar challenges of style-based indexes
- Single and multi-factor strategies can become too "factor focused", ignoring interaction effects and sacrificing diversification and other risk management principles unnecessarily

# **Implications for Asset Allocators**

FOR FINANCIAL PROFESSIONAL USE ONLY/NOT FOR DISTRIBUTION TO THE PUBLIC

Avantis Investors® By American Century Investments®

### **Implications for Expected Returns**



Source: Avantis Investors and Sunil Wahal, CRSP/Compustat, U.S. Securities, 1973-2023

### **Implications for Asset Allocation**

#### Expectations from empirical evidence based on the valuation framework.



### **Thinking Beyond Factors and Indexes**

Financial Science and Research on Asset Pricing and Factors taught us:

Certain stock characteristics are associated with premiums

Premiums can be linked to valuations

To create better portfolios:

We do not need the factors factors are just <u>one possible</u> implementation of a concept

We need the underlying concepts we learned from research and their interactions

Bassu (1977), Stattman (1980), Banz (1981), Rosenberg (1985), Bhandari (1988)

# **Questions?**

FOR FINANCIAL PROFESSIONAL USE ONLY/NOT FOR DISTRIBUTION TO THE PUBLIC

Avantis Investors® By American Century Investments®



# Appendix

FOR FINANCIAL PROFESSIONAL USE ONLY/NOT FOR DISTRIBUTION TO THE PUBLIC



#### **Disclosures**

Expected Returns: Valuation theory shows that the expected return of a stock is a function of its current price, its book equity (assets minus liabilities) and expected future profits, and that the expected return of a bond is a function of its current yield and its expected capital appreciation (depreciation). We use information in current market prices and company financials to identify differences in expected returns among securities, seeking to overweight securities with higher expected returns based on this current market information. Actual returns may be different than expected returns, and there is no guarantee that the strategy will be successful.

The opinions expressed are those of American Century Investments (or the fund manager) and are no guarantee of the future performance of any American Century Investments fund. This information is for educational purposes only and is not intended as investment advice.

This material has been prepared for educational purposes only. It is not intended to provide, and should not be relied upon for, investment, accounting, legal or tax advice.

© 2025 American Century Proprietary Holdings, Inc. All rights reserved.

For Investment Professional Use Only. The information contained herein must be treated in a confidential manner and may not be reproduced, used or disclosed, in whole or in part, without the prior written consent of American Century. Disclosure to any persons other than the recipient and its representatives is prohibited.